Factors Enhancing the Implementation of Business Education Curriculum in Colleges of Education in North Eastern Nigeria

Maryam Salisu, Umar Inuwa
1Department of Business Education, School of Vocational and Technical Education, Aminu Saleh College of Education, Azare.
2Department of Vocational and Technology Education, Faculty of Technology Education, Abubakar Tafawa Balewa University, Bauchi, Nigeria.

Abstract
This study focuses on factors enhancing the implementation of business education curriculum in colleges of education in North Eastern Nigeria. The study adopted survey research design. The sample of the study comprised 144 Business Education lecturers and 144 NCE III Business Education students. A simple random sampling was used in the study. The data was collected using Implementation of Business Education Curriculum Questionnaire. The data collected was analyzed using multiple regression. The findings revealed that availability of instructional resources and utilization of instructional resources enhanced the implementation of Business Education curriculum in colleges of education in North-East Nigeria significantly. Therefore, business education curriculum in colleges of education can be properly implemented by providing and ensuring the effective utilization of instructional resources. This will enable business education graduates of colleges of education to acquire a sufficient practical and professional competencies to become a self-reliant citizens in society.

INTRODUCTION
The education system in Nigeria is the collective responsibility of the federal, state, and local governments. The Federal Ministry of Education plays major roles in regulating the education system, such as the establishment of education policy and ensuring quality control. However, the federal government is more concerned with tertiary education. The state governments, on the other hand, maintain the secondary education while the local governments control the primary education. Hence, education sector in Nigeria is divided into three (3) subsectors, namely: basic education (.nine years program), senior secondary school education (three years program), and tertiary education (two to seven years program, depending on the course of study). The tertiary education comprises of University, Polytechnics and Colleges Education (Federal Republic of Nigeria, 2013).

Nwankwo (1998) stated that, Nigeria Colleges of Education are contributing to national development in their ability to adapt quickly to the educational needs of their immediate environment, pre-occupation with universal academic, cultures, scholarships, research and international acceptability, responding promptly and appropriately to the local needs and demands. Standing at the middle, as they are colleges of education are often called upon to mount flexible programme that can be tailored to the urgent requirements of the primary and junior secondary schools.

Business education is one of the colleges of education program in Nigeria and the primary objective of the program is to provide the learners with employability working skills and prepare them to function intelligently as consumers and citizens in a business economy (Okoli, 2010). Similarly, Onayite (2016) argued that business education encompasses education program for business, office occupation, economic understanding, entrepreneurship and it seeks to develop in the learners basic skills for personal use in the future. Equally, Business Education is a part of vocational Education program offered at tertiary education level, which deals with the area of knowledge and competences needed by individuals to enable them to become worthy human beings and effective member of the society (Etonyeaku, 2012). On other hand, Njoku (2006)
stated that business education aims at empowering students with desirable skills, knowledge and value to perform specific functions so as to become self-reliant, it help the students to appreciate the world around them and contribute maximally to the social and economic development of the nation, it also empower students in such a way that they will develop their intellectual capacity which would help them to make informed decisions in all sphere of life. On the other hand, Onyeachu (2008) argued that the objectives any education program of any level of education cannot be achieved if the planned program is not well implemented. He further asserted that no matter how well a curriculum of any subject or course is planned, designed and documented, implementation is important. This is because the problem of most programs arise at the implementation stage. Similarly, Amoo (2009) highlighted that a curriculum may be beautifully planned but will be of no relevance if it is not implemented. The author gives example that in Nigeria, there are beautifully planned and worthwhile curricula which have been crumbled and failed to produce the intended output due to improper implementation. Likewise, Afangideh, (2015) observed that business education curriculum in colleges of education is fraught with a lot of handicaps during implementation which hinder the business education students to acquire the necessary competencies, skills, and knowledge for self-reliant.

But several studies suggested that successful implementation of curriculum at tertiary education level requires availability of instructional resources, and utilization of instructional resources (Acharu & Solomon, 2014; Olok, 2006). In view of the above arguments, the present study aims at examine the factors enhancing the implementation of business education curriculum in colleges of education in North-East Nigeria. With a specific focus on availability of instructional resources and utilization of instructional resources.

The study’s outcome will be relevant to the business education lecturers and students of colleges of education in terms of identifying factors enhancing the implementation of business education curriculum.

LITERATURE REVIEW
Availability and utilization of instructional materials
The effective curriculum delivery requires various types of resources; as stated by Ngozi, (2011) outlined number of resources for effective curriculum delivery as: Successful curriculum implementation depends to a large extent on the availability and utilization of adequate instructional materials or learning resources. Instructional materials generally make the teaching and learning process easier. They offer reality of experience, provide visual aspects to a process or techniques facilitate the understanding of abstract concepts, save time by limiting the use of wordy explanations and provide opportunity for the learner to manipulate objects in the environment. Therefore, it is the responsibility of the schools and their teachers to examine their role in identifying, developing, evaluating, purchasing and sharing of learning resources. Teachers themselves should improvise learning materials from their homes and the school environment and fill their classrooms with them. They should equally note that the use of instructional materials help to concretize the learning process. Instructional materials offer students and their teachers a good opportunity to relate theoretical knowledge to practical experiences in the class, thus imprinting learnt materials in the minds of the young learners.

Instructional Resources in Business Education
Instructional Resources in any teaching and learning environment cannot be over emphasized. This is for the fact that such materials enhances and make teaching and learning easy, lively, an effective teacher is the one who uses the relevant teaching material for easy transmitting of knowledge. Ofoegbu (2003) defines instructional resources as material use to supplement the normal learning process of listening, seeing and writing. Bongotons and Onyenwe (2010) mentioned that one of the pillars of a successful implementation of effective business education teacher is the availability and adequacy of teaching and learning materials. These materials are in form of facilities and equipment needed to foster skill development and allow for standards and quality products. In their view, availability or adequacy of teaching and learning materials implies that they are easily, readily, publicly and generally found and enough in quantity and quality for use. Unfortunately one of the major challenges facing the colleges of education and indeed business education is inadequate infrastructural facilities; which are inadequate class rooms, laboratory equipment, inadequate teaching and learning resources. The above assertion is also supported by Ayelotan and Shologbade (2014), when they mentioned that physical facilities and equipment are inadequate in
the colleges of education offering business program. They further maintained that availability of appropriate infrastructural facilities will enhance students learning by allowing them to be involved in demonstrations and practices which will build and concretize their skills.

Aliyu (2001) found that instructional material help the teacher to promote teaching/learning activities. He is of the view that any school that desires to offer business education program must include in its program a thorough training in use of instructional materials. The school must be equipped with appliance. He continues by saying just as textbooks must be selected and make available adequate equipment and proper maintenance of the equipment are very necessary for effective curriculum delivery. The NCCE (2008) classified resources in business education into the following: Physical Facilities (this includes classrooms, staff offices, libraries, typing laboratories, model offices and shorthand studios), Equipment and Supplies (this includes the computers, photocopiers, tape-recorders, headphones, perforators, punching machines, stopwatch, stapling machine and others), Personnel (this includes the lecturers, instructors, technologists, and other support staff). Instructional resources are vital inputs that promote learning. Instructional resources according to Gustafson and Gasperini (2011) are those resources that the teacher and students use to influence the effectiveness of teaching and learning process.

According to Eze (2008) instructional resources are those basic requirements that aid and facilitate effective school teaching and learning. Instructional resources comprise human beings (teachers), facilities and equipment for teaching and learning. In business education, instructional resources include the business educators (teachers), typing laboratories, shorthand studios, model offices facilities, such as classroom, library, as well as equipment such as computers, typewriters among others.

Office Accommodation: No organization can function effectively without an office so also in the academic circle, the office is described as a second home for teacher because much of the academic time is spent in the office engaging in one form of research, attending to students, preparing for lecture and other related academic matters.

Typing Laboratory and Shorthand Studio: Typing Laboratory and shorthand studio are essential to the teaching of business education program at any school level and the success of most of its courses is much dependent on the laboratory/studio and the provisions made for them. The teacher assumes a position of disperser of knowledge with the laboratory/studio serving the function of drill or verification and at the other extreme; the teacher assumes the position of guide to learning and laboratory/studio as a place where knowledge is discovered. Hence Yadar, (2007) posited that some courses in science and vocational education cannot be considered as complete without including some practical work.

Books and Library: The most used of self-instructional facility has been the book. The book is still the most economical, most easily accessible and means of conveying information and ideas, considering the cost, size and operating problems of most instructional media. It is indeed the primary and basic source of information and idea in business education.

Model office: Model office is designed in such a way that it represents the actual operations happening in the real offices of a business situation. It is used to teach office clerical and secretarial practice. The model office is a simulation system which is used to enable business education students to experience working conditions and standards likely to be encountered in the real business offices after school. A business education model office usually has a receptionist, equipped with facilities and gadgets of a modern office. Minimum instructional resources needed to administer and run a business education program in the college of education as enshrined in NCCE (2008) document. Furthermore, in order to ensure that these minimum standards are maintained, the NCCE conducts a routine accreditation exercise of programs run in the colleges of education. The major objective of accreditation program according to National Board for Technical Education (2004) is to ensure that schools attain, sustained ultimately exceed the minimum standards in curriculum, staffing, physical facilities and equipment.

But, Ukohe and Agha, (2004) observed that in colleges of education, a lot of fraud is being perpetrated by management in the effort to meet the accreditation agency’s stipulations. In their view, equipment and facilities are often borrowed only to be returned once the accreditation is over leaving the program not richer after the accreditation visit. This is the situation of many tertiary institutions in Nigeria. However, instructional resources have been observed as a potent factor to qualitative and quantitative...
education. The importance of teaching and learning is the provision of instructional resources which cannot be over-emphasized. Facilities and equipment constitute a strategic factor in organizational functioning and determine to a very large extent the smooth functioning of any social organization or system including education (Oyinloye & Oluwalola, 2014).

Similarly, availability and adequacy of instructional resources promote effective teaching and learning activities in schools while their inadequacy and/or unavailability may affect the academic performance of the learner negatively. The success of any system is a function of the available resources to run the system. Business education program as a system can only be effectively implemented with adequate educational resources. Teaching facilities and equipment help to stimulate the interest of the students. Whenever these facilities and equipment are optimally utilized, they generate greater students' interest in the learning system and also enhance retention of ideas. The realization of the objectives of any educational program depends on a number of factors such as the availability and adequacy of instructional resources.

Moreover, in order to ensure an effective teaching and learning of business education program at all levels, it is important for the teacher to be thoroughly acquainted with the teaching resources and service available to him. The component of instructional materials brings about improvement in the teaching and learning as well as permit teacher and students to interact as human being in a climate where people control their environment for their own best purposes (Olawale, 2010). Therefore instructional resources can provide member of a group with a common in-joint-experience. They also bridge language barriers and ease difficulties and at the end make the lesson more meaningful ideas more effectively and faster, likewise, they help to simplify and emphasize facts and clarify difficulties. They reinforce other teaching methods and materials. They improve the efficiency of other materials and effectiveness of teaching process.

Factors that Guide Teachers in the Selection of Instructional Resources

According to Olawale, (2010) To enhance teaching and learning the teacher who wants to use instructional materials should consider the following variables as a guide for him or her in the selection of the types of resources to be use in order to achieved the desired objectives.

I. Availability Before the date of use: the teacher should ensure all of the necessary materials need. This means that the materials should be in store and the teacher should look at it and test it before the day of the lesson. If the teacher has to prepare it himself, he should do so at least a day before the lesson for effective outcome.

II. Accessibility: As a teacher it is your duty to ensure that the materials to be used as instructional material are not only available but also accessible to him. If they are already made materials they should be within the reach of the teacher on the date and time of use. There should be no excuse that the materials are readily available but locked up in the store because the store keeper is nowhere to be found or the keys to the store have been misplaced, the instructional materials should be directly under your control.

III. Affordability: The instructional materials to be used should be less expensive the cost should be affordable in such a way that the teacher can afford it. It is of no use to say that something is available but not affordable due to high cost. There should be a budget for instructional, materials and when this is done the cost should not be outrage us, it should be within the budget of the school.

IV. Appropriateness: The instructional material to be used should ensure the appropriateness of the materials for the intended learners. The materials to be used should equally be considered the materials should not portray an anti-social attitude. They should also be free from any bias, distortion or prejudice. If the material would need electric power then an alternative should be sought out to avoid disappointment from electricity.

V. Qualitative: - The instructional material selected for teaching by the teacher should be of good quality. Teachers should avoid the idea of “managing” with poor quality materials because he might not achieve the target objective.

VI. Suitability: The instructional materials use by the teacher should be suitable for the
ages, intelligence, and learning experience. At the same time ensure the appropriateness of the materials for the intended learners.

VII. **Simplicity:** The instructional materials to use by the teacher should be simple to operate, handle or manipulate. The teacher should test the materials and ensure they are in good working condition before the actual date of use. There should not be any technical problem and where electricity is to be used adequate provision should be made for an alternative power. No teacher should use electricity failure as an excuse for non-performance. In a situation where an instrument demands the hands of a technician, he (the technician) should be on hand and the teacher should have an insight into the operation of the instructional materials as a key agent to the learners.

**Instructional Resources required for Effective Business Education Curriculum implementation in Colleges of Education.**

Instructional resources are materials that enhance the effectiveness of the study of business education. This modern time, when most business organization advertises for vacancies, they indicate specifically that prospective applicants with the knowledge of computer and word processing will be at advantage. This is because the use of technology has come to rule today’s office work and if business education is directly linked with the operation of the office, it therefore, becomes mandatory for anyone going through the business education program to have touched upon the aspect of information technology which should be included in any business education program. This make it imperative for national commission for colleges of education who is the overseer of all colleges of education in Nigeria to review the curriculum of NCE business education in order to meet the needs and requirement of the labor market so that the trainees are employable in any business office after the training. Also teachers in business education program are to make use of the following resources for effective curriculum implementation as stipulated in NCCE minimum standard (2012).

a) **Classrooms:** Space that would take thirty (30) students conveniently with sufficient room for passage within the classroom space should be made available for each lecture and seminar for each subject.

b) **Laboratories/ Studios:** At least, one (1) each of typing-pool, shorthand laboratory, model office and Information Technology room must be available.

c). **Staff offices:** Each senior staff should be provided with a furnished office. The HOD should be provided with a computer facility. There should also be an office for support staff (typists, clerks,) with relevant equipment e.g. typewriters, reproduction machines, etc.

d). **Books in the Library:** There must be enough books in the library to cover all the areas of the subject to the ratio of one student to ten books. A Departmental Library is compulsory for effective management of the program.

**Research Framework**

A framework of this study that indicates the relationship between Availability of instructional resources, Utilization of Instructional resources and implementation of business education curriculum is developed based on systems theory (see Figure 1). The theory was developed by Bertalanffy (1968). The
systems theory is framework which suggested that group of item work together to produce desire result. According the theory, the systems receive inputs from the environment, they transform these inputs into outputs and they discharge their outputs into their environment and receive feedback from the environment. The theory is applicable in a school set up as an organization in which the school as a system receives inputs from the environment (Okumbe, 2001). These input include learning resources and facilities. The good interaction of these components leads to successful curriculum implementation.

The following hypotheses are formulated:

H1: Availability of instructional resources do not significantly enhance the implementation of business education curriculum in colleges of education.

H1: Utilization of Instructional resources do not significantly enhance the implementation of business Education curriculum in colleges of education.

METHODOLOGY

In the present study, a survey research design was adopted to examine the factors enhancing the implementation of business education curriculum in colleges of education in North-East Nigeria. A survey method is used when a researcher is interested in studying the opinions, feelings, and thoughts of the respondents about a particular situation (Creswell 2012). This method enables the researchers to collect and analyze quantitative data as well as suggesting the reasons for the relationship between the variables of interest (Saunders et al., 2009). Hence, a survey method is appropriate for achieving the objective of this study.

The population of this study comprises 144 Business Education lecturers and 712 NCE III business education students in the eight (8) Colleges of Education offering business education in the Northern Nigeria. Lecturers and students were involved in this study because Chauhdhary (2015) argued that curriculum implementation cannot take place without teachers and learners. In addition, NCE III business education students were considered in this study due to the fact that, they are in better position to provide information that will help in achieving the objectives of this study because they have done most of NCE business education courses compare to NCE I and NCE II. For lecturers’ side, entire 144 Business Education lecturers were used in this study because the entire pulation of the study is manageable as the number of Business Education lecturers in the North eastern Nigeria are not much. This is in line with Salkind and Rainwater (2003) who argued that an appropriate sample size is needed for any research because a sample size that contains a very small number of respondents may lead to committing Type I error. Type I error creates the chances of wrongly rejecting results instead of being accepted. In order to avoid the problem of type I the entire population will be study. For students’ side 144 was sampled from the population. Krejcie and Morgan (1970) recommended that 123 are adequate to represent even the population of 780. Therefore, the students’ sample was drawn based on Krejcie and Morgan table for determining the sample size. This is because the table provides the generalized scientific guideline for sample size decisions. The present study increased the sample size to 144 students in order to balance the study’s data for accuracy of the analysis. The same procedure was followed by John (2012); Muthok (2017).

The variables of present study were measured using Implementation of Business Education Curriculum Questionnaire. The instrument was adapted from the previous studies (Ezeji, Ugwoke, Edeh & Okanazu, 2015; Matilda, Summary & Erewarifagha, 2018). This was done because Churchill (1979) recommended that a researcher can adopt or adapt measurement from the prior studies relevant to the current research. The present study has three (3) constructs: Curriculum implementation (5 items), Utilization of instructional resources (9 items), and availability of instructional resources (9 items). In this study, the Likert scale was adopted for all the items, the respondents were asked to indicate their responses to each question on a five-point scale. Krosnick and Fabrigar (1997) opine that a scale between five and seven points is more reliable than higher or lower scales and a scale with no midpoint may increase the measurement error. Similarly, Dawes (2008) states that a five or seven scale is likely to produce better results. The five-point likert scale used in this study is as follows: Strongly Disagree (SD) = 1, Disagree (D) = 2, Undecided (UD) = 3, Agree (A) = 4, and Strongly Agree (SA) = 5. To ensure the reliability of instrument of the present study, the pilot test was conducted pilot study conducted with 30Business Education lecturers and 30Business Education students in Federal College of Education Zaria, Gusau and Bichi to determine the internal consistency of the measurement scale adapted in this study. This is because the institutions are outside the study area.
but the respondents have similar characteristics with the sample of this study. The 30 lecturers and 30 students satisfied the recommended pilot test range from 25-75 (Babbie, 1990; Converse & Presser, 1986). In the present study, the reliabilities of the instrument was assessed using Cronbach alpha, the reliability coefficients of the three construct are; Curriculum implementation (0.86), Utilization of instructional resources (0.77), and availability of instructional resources (0.93). The results suggested that the instrument is reliable based on the recommendation given by Hair et al. (2013); Nunnally (1978). According to them Cronbach’s alpha coefficient of at least .70 is considered satisfactory and acceptable.

Finally, for cleaning of data and analysis, SPSS 23 was used throughout the process. The predictive power of availability of instructional resources, and utilization of instructional resources (i.e., independent variables) on curriculum implementation (i.e., dependent variable) was determined using multiple regression. A multiple regression is a statistical technique for testing the influence of a number of independent variables on one continuous dependent variable (Tabachnick & Fidell, 2007).

FINDINGS

The necessary assumptions of regression analysis were properly assessed and fairly complied. Hair et al. (2013) recommended that when interpreting the result of multiple regression analysis, a researcher should first consider the F value, then the R-square value or adjusted R square, and follow by the individual contribution. Following their recommendation, in this study, the statistical evidence has proved that the model was statistically significant based on the F ratio 44.66, \( p = .000 \). The result also revealed the R\(^2\) value of .24, indicating that the model fit is large (Murphy, Myors & Wolach, 2014).

Concerning the individual contribution of independent variables, the variable availability of instructional resources had a standardized coefficients beta value of .154, \( p = .014 \). This indicates a significant contribution of the variable in the model, that availability of instructional resources significantly enhances the implementation of business education curriculum in colleges of education. This result does not support the prediction of hypothesis H1 that availability of instructional resources does not significantly enhance the implementation of business education curriculum in colleges of education. Similarly, the relationship between utilization of instructional resources and curriculum implementation has a standardized coefficients beta value of .388, \( p = .000 \). This indicates that utilization of instructional resources have a significant contribution in the model. Hypothesis 2 which stated that utilization of instructional resources do not significantly enhance the implementation of business education curriculum in colleges of education is not supported. Hence, utilization of instructional resources enhances the implementation of business education curriculum in colleges of education significantly.

### Table 1: Regression Analysis on factors enhancing the implementation of business education curriculum in colleges of education.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Standardized Coefficients Beta</th>
<th>T value</th>
<th>P value</th>
<th>Decision</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Availability of instructional resources</td>
<td>.154</td>
<td>2.473</td>
<td>.014</td>
<td>Rejected</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utilization of instructional resources</td>
<td>.388</td>
<td>6.224</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>Rejected</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

DISCUSSION

The findings of this study indicated that availability of instructional resources and utilization of instructional resources has significantly enhanced the implementation of business education curriculum in colleges of education. This implies that available and effective utilization of instructional resources significantly enhanced the implementation of business education curriculum in colleges of education. Therefore, business education curriculum in colleges of education can be properly implemented by providing and ensuring the effective utilization of instructional resources and this will enable business education graduates of colleges of education to acquire a sufficient practical and professional competencies to become a self-reliant citizens in society. Bongotons and Onyenwe (2010) who reported that instructional resources had a positive impact on successful implementation of curriculum. The finding is also consistent with the study of Ngozi,
CONCLUSION
The present study examines the factors enhancing the implementation of business education curriculum in colleges of education in North-East Nigeria. The findings of the present study shows that availability and utilization of instructional resources have significantly enhance the implementation of business education curriculum in colleges of education. Therefore, business education curriculum of colleges of education which is fraught with a lot of handicaps during implementation and that hinder the business education students to acquire the necessary competencies, skills, and knowledge for self-reliant could be properly implemented to enable business education graduates of colleges of education to acquire a sufficient practical and professional competencies to become a self-reliant citizens in society.

REFERENCES
Dawes, J. (2008). Do data characteristics change according to the number of scale points used? An experiment using 5-point, 7-point and 10-point scales. International journal of market research, 50(1), 61-104
Patius, O. M. (2014). Factors influencing implementation of Curriculum in Public Primary Schools in Ukwa Division of Siaya County, Kenya: A master’s Thesis submitted to the Department of Education, administration and planning University of Nairobi.